INNOCENT VICTIMS OF PARENTAL CHILD ABDUCTION: THE CHILDREN

Naheed Sultan
PhD Scholar
Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyyah of Laws
International Islamic University Malaysia
50728, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia
Email: naheedaries@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

When we think of child abduction or kidnapping, more commonly we think of stereotypical kidnappings in which children are abducted by total strangers, but the bitter reality is children are at greater risk from their own parents or other close relatives.

The ease of International travelling has led to rising in international relationships and family breakups or divorce which have led to an increase in parental child abduction and it is a growing issue in every part and every nation in the world. Parental child abduction is very common, but the upsetting part is that many people are not aware of this issue and most do not even realise that it is a crime. Mostly, the children are abducted to another country and then sometimes it becomes difficult to even navigate the child. Divergent laws of other country make it difficult to resolve the issue and get back the child. This is a crime which affects every member of the family at any time and any place, but the most vulnerable victims are the children. Parental child abduction can leave an emotional scar on children’s life which can last forever. There is a solution to solve this problem, that is to practice and use The Hague Convention on Civil Aspects of Child Abduction to get back the child before it is too late. But what happens if the country where the child is abducted is not a party to The Hague Convention? This article will show how it affects the children and how to come up with solutions to prevent this terrifying crime.

Keywords: Parental Child Abduction, Custody, Shariah, Mediation

INTRODUCTION:

When international marriages increased in 1970’s, parental child abduction began to rise and turned out to be an international problem. It was a serious challenge and source of concern for all the concerned authorities and it remains to be a serious problem today.¹

World has become a global village and international relationships are increasing and families form across the international borders. With increase in international marriages, increase in international divorce and custody issues can also be seen. Marital issues and family laws which were previously settled within the state or nation are now demanding international application because of diversity of laws of different nations.²

Parental child abduction is not considered as an act of love for the child. It is a crime and revenge on the other partner and the pain never leaves. International child abduction is not something new and it generally refers to wrongful removal or wrongful retention of child to another country by the child’s parent or guardian. It is an international phenomenon spread from north to south and east to west and it is not confined to just one country. kidnappings or parental child abduction can be seen more in multicultural nations with high immigration.³

---


Parental child abduction or stealing of the child by the parent is not a new phenomenon in today’s era. Definition of parental child abduction is “taking, retention, or concealment of a child or children by a parent, another family member, or their agent, in derogation of the custody rights, including visitation rights, of another parent or family member.  

With technological advancements, the world has become a global village where travelling is easy and making friends is easy. People from different countries and different nationalities are getting into relationship and marrying. International divorces and custody issues have also increased because of the international relationships. All these things speed up the issue of parental child abduction.

Parental child abduction occasionally happens, when parents commence divorce proceedings or get separate. The parent who is not given custody of the child or fears losing the custody of the child may remove or retain the child from the other parent just to gain advantage or to take revenge from the other parent. Another circumstance arises when a parent may refuse to return a child and escape with the child to prevent an access visit or do so because of domestic violence and abuse. Parental child abductions can take place within the same country or can be across the borders. The number of cases of international parental child abduction is small in comparison to domestic cases but are often the most difficult to resolve because of the conflicting international jurisdictions.

Issues of marriage, divorce and custody, that were once fixed within the state are now demanding international application. Family law of each country is different and loaded with cultural values and beliefs about gender roles and what is best for children. Western laws and Islamic laws are completely different from each other. Fathers and mothers play different roles in their children’s lives in Islamic law than in Western law. Parents play the role of a shield to protect the children and children view their parents as their superheroes. When a family breaks down, the custody issue of children arises, and each parent tries their best to take the custody of the child. When a court decides to give the custody of the child to either of the parents then the other parent who is not happy with the court decision tries to abduct the child within the country or across the borders.

When the child is abducted across the borders then it becomes difficult to navigate and get back the child because of the conflicting laws of different nations. Parental child abduction is a crime in most parts of the world but in some countries, it goes unchecked and unpunished. This crime affects the child and the left-behind parent who has the legal custody of the child, but the child has taken away from the parent unlawfully. This crime affects the innocent child psychologically and mentally because moving the child from his familiar place and environment to an unfamiliar environment makes the child psychologically ill.

When cases of parental child abduction increased in 1970s and it became a serious issue due to trouble of gaining international co-operation, the urgent need arose for a Hague Conference. So, to deal with such issues of parental child abduction, The Hague Convention on Child Abduction was drafted in 1980.

The objectives of the convention are,
(1) “to secure the prompt return of the children wrongful removed or retained in any contracting state” and
(2) “to ensure the rights of custody and of access under the law of one contracting State are effectively respected in the other contracting state”.

The main purpose of The Hague Convention is to secure the prompt return of the children who have been removed wrongfully from their place of habitual residence and to minimise the effects negative effect of parental child abduction.


8 Freeman, M. (2006). “International Child abduction: The effects”. (Marilyn did this research for the reunite Research Unit)


Another aim of The Hague Convention on Child Abduction is to give solutions to the children who are removed wrongfully from their existing place of residence and it has nothing to do with the custody of the child. If a child is abducted to a country which is not a member of The Hague Convention, then The Hague Convention will not be able to cope in such situations and is inapplicable.

The Hague Convention works only in those countries who are a member to it and not all are members to it. Most of the Muslim countries are not a member of it, which makes the Convention useless in a situation when the child is abducted to such country. Even though there are 98 Contracting States who are the member of the 1980 Hague Child Abduction Convention but only 10 among them are the Muslim majority countries, namely: Albania, Burkina Faso, Guinea, Iraq, Kazakhstan, Morocco, Pakistan, Turkey, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan. One such Muslim country who is not a member of The Hague Children Convention is Malaysia.12

Schnitzer-Reese puts it nicely, she says, “The reality of the Convention’s reach resembles a fishing net permeated with large holes: cast this net and you might catch some fish, but it is more likely that the fish will swim out through the readily available holes. The holes of the net represent those countries which are not party to the Convention; the fish are the abducting parents, and they swim, abducted kids in tow, directly towards the holes, where they in fact find protection from the world community that seeks to prosecute them”.13

All these countries who are not a member to The Hague Convention are considered a safe haven for the abducting parents and legal black hole for the left-behind parent and the child.14

Malaysia is the multi-ethnic country and Islam is the religion of the federation. Islamic law is applicable to Muslims irrespective of ethnicity. Malaysia has a dual legal system which is civil and Shariah. It is difficult to navigate a child specially when the child is abducted by his Muslim father to a non-Hague country with Shariah based family laws and One such country is Malaysia and marriages of different nationalities are increasing in Malaysia. Considering that Malaysia is not a member of The Hague Child Abduction Convention then there should be strong domestic laws and enforcement agencies to prevent the incidence of parental child abduction which is increasing at an alarming rate. The presence of the act of parental child abduction can be seen from the Crime Investigation Department, Malaysian Royal Police Headquarters, Kuala Lumpur and if it is not cured instantly then it can turn into a massive problem for the Nation and can affect the innocent children who are the backbone of any society.15 One of the leading case is that of Raja Bahrain where a Malaysian Terengganu Prince was married to an Australian lady who was an Australian citizen. That lady after divorce renounced Islam and went to Australia with her two children and there she applied in Australian family court for their custody, so she was then granted their custody _by the Australian family court. When their father came to know about this he flew to Australia and abduct their children to Malaysia by the intention of saving the religion of his children. He then applied in Shariah courts of Terengganu Malaysia for their custody and successfully got their custody. This case is still unresolved as there is no co-operation between Malaysia and Australia. At that time, Australia was a non-Hague country so could not do anything. This leading case show the dual system of Malaysia and the clash between civil and Shariah courts of Malaysia.16

This article thus studies the Laws of Malaysia relating to International parental child abduction and whether those laws are sufficient enough to solve or limit the issue of International parental child abduction and it also examines the effects of parental child abduction on children.

MALAYSIAN STATUTORY PROVISIONS RELATED TO CHILD ABDUCTION THE PENAL CODE (ACT 574)

The main criminal law Statute in Malaysia is the Penal Code and according to Penal code there are two types of kidnapping that are kidnapping from Malaysia and kidnapping from lawful guardianship. Section 360 of the Penal Code deals with kidnapping relocation disputes? (A Mini-Thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the Master's degree. University of the Western Cape).


from Malaysia and section 361 deals with kidnapping from lawful guardianship. Both these section of the Penal Code does not cover the cross-border parental child abduction. It seems like Parental child abduction is not yet a crime in Malaysia unlike other countries where this is a crime.

THE CHILD ACT 2001 (ACT 611)
There is another Act, the Child Act and Section 52 of this Act cover parental child abduction inside Malaysia and across the borders, but it only covers and deals with abduction which is committed by the non-custodial parent and does not deal and cover the abduction committed by the custodial parent. The Sections articulates that:

52.(1) Any parent or guardian who-
(a)does not have the lawful custody of a child and
(b) takes or sends out a child, whether within or outside Malaysia without the consent of the person who has the lawful custody of the child commits an offence and shall on conviction be liable to a fine not exceeding ten thousand ringgits or to imprisonment for a term not exceeding five years or to both.

(2) A person has lawful custody of a child under this section if he has been conferred the custody of the child by any written law or by an order of a court, including a Syariah Court. Section 52 (3) (a) (i) of the same Act provides a defence to a non-custodial parent in taking away the child with the belief that the other custodial parent agreed or would have been agreed to the taking of the child and was aware of all the related situations. So, when the non-custodial parent can satisfy the court with all the shreds of evidence that he/she tried to contact the other custodial parent but was unsuccessful then such act of non-custodial parent will not contemplate a crime if the person provides necessary evidence to satisfy the court.15


Under the Section 89 (2) of the Law Reform (Marriage and Divorce) Act and section 87 (2) (e) of the Islamic Family Law (Federal Territories) Act, when the custody is given to any parent by the court then the court will impose certain conditions upon the custodial parent of the child and prohibits the person to take the child out of Malaysia. These provisions provide that the child needs the protection of both the parents and a child has a right of a personal access and contact with both parents and the custodial parent, therefore, the custodial parent cannot take the child out of Malaysia because this will separate the child from the other left-behind parent. So, these provisions protect cross-border parental child abduction to some extent as it only prohibits custodial parent and does not prohibit the non-custodial parent.

THE EFFECTS OF PARENTAL CHILD ABDUCTION ON CHILDREN
The most psychologically harmful crime of all is parental child abduction and it takes ages to heal from its effects and wounds. Abduction causes deep mental and physical scars on everyone involved especially the children and leaves them to encounter through the issues of trust, love and respect. When a child is abducted his/her life changes forever. When a child is abducted by one of the parents, it is assumed that he/she must be fine because the child is with the other parent, but the reality is different. There is a saying that ‘only the shoe wearer knows where the shoe pinches’ so in parental child abduction only those knows it well who are affected by this crime. In most cases, the victims are the children because the children need the protection and love of both the parents and when one parent abducts the child from the other parent it destroys the life of an innocent child.

The children abducted are mostly younger and when they are abducted, they are on the constant move from one place to other, their identities are changed, and they get little or no schooling and medical care which affects their health. Abduction will affect each person and each child differently because everyone has their own style to cope with the situation. The impact of abduction on children will be determined by the child’s age and relationship with the abductor and relationship with the left-behind parent. The research completed by reunite research unit found that children who are abducted suffered stress and showed physical symptoms such as terrible crying, headaches bed-wetting and sickness. The older children whose ages are five or above gets more affected by abduction than the children under five years or below. Every child reacts differently to the abduction, older children get more affected by it because younger ones get adjusted easily to any situation if their basic requirements are satisfied. Grownup children blame themselves for their parent’s separation or divorce and think pessimistically and feel guilty all the time.

17 The Penal Code, Laws of Malaysia, Act 574 (Section 360 and 361).
18 The Child Act 2001 (Section 52).

20 The Law Reform (Marriage and Divorce) Act 1976, Section 89(2)(e), and Islamic Family Law (Federal Territories) Act 1984, Section 87(2)(e).

Sometimes the children are being told that the other parent does not like them or want them then they get saddened and get the impression of being rejected.22

Children feel insecure and get anxiety and depression, constant moving of places makes them tired and frustrated. Mostly, the abducted parent tries to hide their identity and change their names, so this behaviour of the parent will smash children’s self-confidence. Children will have trust issues when their parent keep lying to everyone and change their identity. Even when children are returned, they get psychological problems such as post-traumatic effects and they fear re-abduction and can have attachment disorder with left-behind parent. Children struggle in trusting others after the abduction and it takes ages for the child to recover from the traumatic effects of the abduction and to feel comfortable and to trust others.23

Parental child abduction is a form of child abuse because life on the run separates the child from the other parent, deprived them of the right education, proper medical care and disrupts their life. To sum up, the parental child has a very negative effect on the overall wellbeing of the child and it can destroy the child’s personality and can have a long-lasting effect which can take ages to recover and heal. There should be some preventive measures to stop this crime before it destroys the life of more children.

CONCLUSION
The purpose of this article was to find out the effects of parental child abduction on children and to understand the laws of the Malaysia, who is not a member to The Hague Convention.104 whether the laws of Malaysia are adequate to curb the issue of parental child abduction within the country and across the borders. Parental child abduction is a frightening reality and it is increasing. Mostly people are not aware of the fact that this kind of abduction is affecting the children badly because life on the run makes them sick and it effects their overall well-being and happiness. Children need both their parents and a safe environment where they can grow healthy and happily. It is mostly assumed that if a parent abducts their child, nothing is wrong in it because they are in the safe hands, but it is not the reality, parental child abduction is a crime and is a form of child abuse. It is a natural right of every child to have a nice, safe and a happy childhood, but this kind of abduction ruin their happiness and overall activities. World has become a global village where traveling is easy and abducted parent can run away with the child to any country. Thus, in most countries this crime goes unchecked and unpunished. It is concluded that the effects of parental child abduction are enormous and effects every member of the family differently and has a very negative effect on the children abducted and it can take them ages to heal and recover. Children are not being protected and are in danger of abduction and it is affecting them severely. It is also observed that laws of Malaysia are deficient to solve the problem at national and international levels. There should be an alternative source when dealing with countries who are non-signatories to The Hague Child Abduction Convention just like Malaysia so, this article is giving some recommendations regarding parental child abduction and how to cope with it and safe the children from negative effects of this heinous crime.

RECOMMENDATIONS
The following are the recommendations after looking at all the consequences of parental child abduction.

(i) PROTECTION
The children can be saved from the damaging effects of parental child abduction by protecting them. There is a perception among the common public that parents cannot abduct their children and they are the natural guardian of their children. This perception is wrong that parents cannot abduct their child and if they do its normal. The NGO’s and related authorities should come up with workshops and seminars to make awareness among the people about the parental child abduction and its negative effects. To reduce the harmful effects of abduction by providing some support system and care for those who have been abducted. Judiciary and local authorities should make policies to train the children and parents to save them from the harmful effects of abduction. When children are returned there should be some mentor or psychologist to support the children and to minimize their bad experience by counselling with them. Awareness programme should be provided at school, college, and university levels to make awareness among the children.

(ii) PREVENTION
The government should revise its laws related to custody and parental child abduction to prevent this damaging crime at national and at the international level. With the ease in international travelling, parental child abduction has increased. The government should investigate its immigration rules and policies to prevent the parental child abduction. Mostly, children are abducted where there is any family dispute, parents should know the legal and socio-legal aspect of parental child abduction. There are many factors of parental child abduction, the lawyers and policymakers should check all the factors which are responsible for parental child abduction and try to minimize it by controlling the factors. There is a saying that prevention is better than cure. It is better to prevent it by controlling it rather than to deal with it after it has happened.

22Freeman, M. (2006). “International Child abduction: The effects”. (Marilyn did this research for the reunite Research Unit)
(iii) MEDIATION

Parental child abduction has increased recently and when the child is abducted across the borders then social, cultural and religious clashes happen if the parents are of different nationalities and religion. It complicates the situation even more because of the diversity of laws. Every country has a different legal system and cultural values. Because of all these issues then it takes ages to solve the problem of parental child abduction or it results in failure.24 Even with The Hague Abduction Convention, the problem of Parental child abduction is not reducing that is because not every country is a member to The Hague Convention and when the parental child case happens in such country then the Convention becomes purposeless in such situation because it is not applicable to such country who is not a member.25 Many researchers after looking at the seriousness of the issue of parental child abduction, come up with planned explanations to resolve the issue and among all the proposed solutions the alternative dispute resolution ADR mainly the Mediation appeared to be more effective to resolve the issue of parental child abduction.26

Mediation helps parents come to any conclusion and can be vital in the field of Family Law and the purpose of this is to ensure settlements after separation.27

The Hague Convention is time consuming, expensive and unpredictable at times but mediation, on the other hand, can simplify a speedy resolution, bring about balance of power, and lessen costs. Mediation has more possibilities to solve the case of parental child abduction.28

There is a guide book known as Guide to Good Practice and it falls within the scope of the 1980 Hague Convention, it is prepared to encourage good practices in mediation and is another method of dispute resolution in which children are involved.29

Non-Muslims marriages in Malaysia primarily use the dispute resolution system. In Malaysia, the Mediation Act 2012 governs the procedure and practice of mediation. Mediation can be useful to settle the dispute among the parties and it is convenient and not expensive, so it can be easily adopted. For the mediation to be useful, it is compulsory that the third party must be impartial and neutral and must have the knowledge and relevant skills to handle the dispute.30

Malaysia can facilitate mediation process in family disputes especially when children are involved, and this way parental child abduction can be reduced by settling the issue between the parents.31

To sum up, mediation, when used in ethical and appropriate ways, can be very useful to reduce the crimes of parental child abduction. Various factors can affect mediation such as clashes of cultural, religion and diverse legal system when children abducted are across the borders. Regardless of all these challenges, complications and blockades, mediation is still useful, and one cannot deny benefits of it. Therefore, it is a need of the time to promote mediation in cases of parental child abduction to reduce this heinous crime and to save children from its harmful effects.


REFERENCES


